A need for change: A reflective account of the introduction of photo elicitation to the selection process for students of nursing and midwifery

Hazel A. Hughes *

University Campus Suffolk, Ipswich, Suffolk, United Kingdom

Received: August 2, 2013  Accepted: November 4, 2014  Online Published: November 12, 2014
DOI: 10.5430/jnep.v5n2p9  URL: http://dx.doi.org/10.5430/jnep.v5n2p9

Abstract

Attrition from programmes of health and social care education is a current cause for concern within all higher education environments. Not only are institutional finances burdened by attrition, but also its impact on the remaining students, commissioning services and ultimately the professions’ themselves are well noted. A number of key areas have been highlighted as contributing to the reduction of attrition, amongst them selection and recruitment is seen as key. Using a reflective approach current strategies used within a Higher Education (HE) facility in the east of England are considered. Through analysis and evaluation of a newly introduced strategy, that of using photo elicitation, its valuable contribution is asserted. Traditionally, candidates have been selected and recruited using a variety of screening tools, not least the face to face interview. It is conceivable that, if this approach is to be able to confidently reduce attrition and retain quality students investment in the process is essential. Herein, within this paper the use of photo elicitation is examined. Considered in the context of usage as an interview technique, it’s worth in the recruitment process of students to health care courses is evaluated. A meaningfulness is asserted in identifying candidates whose values and beliefs are aligned with both the HE establishment and the commissioning bodies within the health care setting portraying them as ‘best match’ to the requisite profile.

Key Words: Photo elicitation, Recruitment interviews, Reduction of attrition, Best match, Shared values and beliefs

1 Introduction

Attrition amongst Nursing and Midwifery students has long been characterised as a ‘wicked problem’ (DH, 2006[^1]), and in current climates of austerity it is essential that universities make every effort to address this issue. Equally significant is the personalities of those students that do go on to enter professional registers. Herein individuals retained on courses must be of a standard that maintains and further promotes National Health Service (NHS) values and visions (Department of health 2012[^2]).

Attrition is a major issue for three principal reasons: The financial burden upon the university attributed to students’ withdrawal (Higher Education Funding Council for England 2009[^3]); the quality of the experience of the exiting student, and the remaining cohort members; and its negative effect on commissioning of training places by NHS Services. The significance of attrition cannot be understated as non-continuation rates are recognised as key quality performance indicators by funders (Johnston 2011[^4]).

A number of key areas have been highlighted as supporting students and reducing attrition, such as effective mar-
keting and in particular effectual recruitment and selection processes (Department of Health, 2006[11] McCallum et al., 2006[5] McCarey et al., 2007[6]). Within her work Hughes (2013[7]), gave detailed consideration of the connection between recruitment and retention. Although her viewpoints substantiated other authors’ findings; It went further to examine how changes to selection and recruitment strategies; and development of innovative approaches might facilitate movement beyond the traditional interview.

The need for this change is significant for two reasons. Firstly, as already identified is that of attrition. Secondly, and potentially of greater importance, is the knowledge that many students provide a rationale of ‘wrong career choice’ when exiting courses. It became clear that in order to reduce attrition selectors and recruiters required a process in which they are able to identify those candidates who, through reasons of limited preparation, knowledge and/or understanding of the demands of the course and the profession as a whole, are deselected prior to starting the programme of study.

1.1 Background

A strong interest led to the author undertaking an enquiry into the processes in place within the HE facility and their relationship with attrition. With a premise that inane questioning by interviewers and rehearsed responses by candidates do little to inform the interviewer; and worse still, to allow the interviewee to show themselves in terms of personal qualities and commitment to all aspects of the applied for programme; the need for change became clear.

Through investigation and adaptation of Tinto’s model (Tinto 1975[9]), aimed fostering a sense of belonging and placing the candidate at the centre of selection processes, a detailed understanding of the need for the candidate voice to be truly heard was borne. Central to this understanding was the development of the idea of using photo elicitation as a medium for self-expression within their recruitment process.

1.2 Literature review

Photo elicitation has a long history in anthropology and sociological studies, with evidence of its first use over half a century ago. Within his works Collier (1957) printed 2009[9]) used photographs to inform his understanding regarding the adaptability of residence of a small town, to its changing demographics. His findings were interesting with details of how the use of photographs elicited material that was comprehensive. It went further than this, however, and Collier’s work determined that frequently the informant was enthused to really express themselves as individuals in quite some detail. Further studies by Collier published some ten years later, gave the world an introduction to photo elicitation as laying the foundations for visual anthropology and sociology.

It is perhaps within the works of Harper (2002[10]) where definition of photo elucidation pinpoints the potential of using photographs in recruitment interviews. Recognising aspects of emotional intelligence (Goleman, 1996[11]) and the symbolic way in which the brain interprets visual information, Harper, identifies the value of photographs as not only eliciting more information but also that of a different kind. It may be this in-depth and personally constructed detail that can provide interviewers with the unique insight that enables them to risk assess the candidate in terms of attrition from the course and ultimately the profession beyond.

There is no doubt that nursing and midwifery are in the midst of significant change; resulting in the decisions taken by selectors’ of increasing consequence. Creating solutions around attrition at the recruitment stage may indeed contribute toward the security of nursing and midwifery’s future. For it could be argued that it is at this stage, using innovative approaches, that candidate’s ability to meet the demands of the increasingly nebulous nature of the workforce can be identified.

Using Driscoll’s (2007[12]) model, reflective enquiry was undertaken to ascertain the value and future development needs, of the recruitment processes, employed by a regional university. This three stage model was chosen for this enquiry as it enables succinct identification of the subject; promotes analysis in order that broad understanding occurs; and enables sound conclusions to be drawn that facilitates feedback to continually improve.

Attrition across the spectrum of higher education institutions has long been an area of concern. In recent time’s withdrawal from courses amongst students of nursing and midwifery has been noted as increasing in trend (Department of Health 2007[13]).

Admissions tutors can be seen as playing a significant role in the reduction of attrition through application of selection and recruitment strategies that better identify potential ‘attrition risk factors’ amongst applicants.

Within his work Evan Cohen (2009[14]) succinctly addresses the problem with which the nursing and midwifery teams, within a regional university, were confronted. It was perhaps his work that was the catalyst for the development of the newly established recruitment strategies, and the subject of this evaluation. Cohen’s work identifies, the primary element of any recruitment strategy as being that of finding the ‘qualified best match’ (ibid page 8).

1.3 Aim: Establishing best match

Given that the education of midwives and nurses is a partnership undertaking between clinical, practice based providers and universities it was essential that establishing what the ‘best match’ looked like should be a collaborative event. Clinicians’ viewpoints were considered essential for
two reasons. Firstly approximately 50% of nursing and midwifery training is undertaken in the clinical practice environment. In addition, exit interviews undertaken by withdrawing students has identified attrition as frequently occurring as a result of clinical encounters.

Also significant, and in many ways central to the undertaking, was the opinion of childbearing women themselves. For this reason viewpoints that created a picture of the ‘ideal candidate’ and from which whom a ‘best match’ could be determined were sought and systematically applied to candidate profiling.

This was further supported through consideration of the profiles of strongly performing students, from current cohorts, and isolating those traits in common. This allowed realism to temper a situation where ideology may inadvertently lead to exclusion of candidates contrary to legislation. An example of this is that of the overwhelming wish of some women to be cared for by a female during the period of labour and birth and a small number of comments relating to ethnicity. Indeed enrolling, retaining and graduating more minority groups, to ensure diversity in the workforce, is amongst priorities for policy makers (Augustus-Dapremont, 2013[15]). Despite the occasional disparity between pragmatism and personal beliefs, the undertaking did provide the basis upon which a systematic approach to candidate profiling could be made.

1.4 A three step plan was devised and implemented

The first step was designed to support potential applicants in deciding for themselves their suitability for the course and the value in their submitting application. This was achieved through website development that continues to be enhanced, to ensure all necessary information can be easily found. This includes frequently asked questions, celebrates student success and provides direct contact details of the admissions tutor.

Evidence suggests that personal statements are poor indicators of the candidate’s true personality. For that reason the second step uses a process that demands more of the applicant in terms of verification of content from within their personal statement (Frean 2009[16]). Interview questions draw on detail within the statement in order that they can be further substantiated and expanded upon.

1.5 Introducing photo elicitation interview techniques

The third and final step was to ensure that the interview gave rise to open communication in which the candidate could express their unique qualities allowing interviewers to ascertain their fit with the predetermined ‘best match’. This is seen as essential as recognising academic quality, while important; needs to be considered in the wider context of the candidate as a whole. The admissions tutor was acutely aware of the use of emotional intelligence (EI) and the value of using EI questioning in the interview setting (Bailey and Borooah 2007,[17] Rankin 2011[18]). It was acknowledged, however, that the use of such strategies that involve psychological screening might demand sophisticated input and as such would be beyond the capabilities of the interview panel.

2 Method and design

The Photo elicitation interview (PEI) (Epstein et al. 2006[19]) was considered as an equally valuable alternative and in early 2013 was put into place as a pilot study. By considering information candidates shared through the photographic medium, interviewers could measure their suitability for the course and also risk assess their potential for attrition. Candidates were asked to bring with them, two or three photos of significance and were given the following task- “Using the photographs you have brought with you today, tell us about yourself and the qualities you think they display that you will bring to the course and the profession as a whole.”

This enabled the candidate to portray the ‘soft skills’ so closely aligned with emotional intelligence but also enabled the interview panel to gain insight into the candidate’s life shaping experiences, values, attitudes and beliefs. Considering these in the context of the ‘best match profile’ interviewers were able to gain insight into the previously unseen side of candidates and to be discerning of the subtle differences that demonstrated greatest potential for the course.

The use of pictures to facilitate reflection within the research setting is rapidly gaining in popularity as a participatory methodology. Its use and benefits in terms of selection and recruitment are, however, are less well recorded. Identified as a medium for self-expression, the aim was to gain greater insight into the candidate’s ability to fit the required ‘best match profile’ of the student being sought.

Applications to midwifery programmes of education are heavily oversubscribed. With the dearth of seemingly suitable candidates in terms of educational attainment and on the face of it, ‘best match’ profiles within the personal statement, discernment can be challenging. As such, it is generally from personal engagement that decisions around recruitment are made.

Interviews have historically been the medium through which this personal engagement is undertaken but can remain fraught with difficulty. In times of austerity and the need for universities to meet the demands of an ever-changing workforce, selectors must assess potential beyond recruitment, through retention, to completion of the course. It can be argued therefore that the need to go beyond standard interviews, to more innovative approaches that more thoroughly ‘risk-assess’ candidates’ potential for attrition are essential.
The last decade has seen a steady increase in terms of recognising ‘emotional intelligence’ and its relationship to ways of knowing. Adjunct to this, a rise in qualitative research, using sensory methodologies, has been brought to the fore (Mason and Davies 2009[20]). Given that the senses are intrinsically linked with one’s interpretation and understanding of the lived experience, the methodology’s value in terms of eliciting deep and meaningful data cannot be understated. The merits of photo elicitation, as a qualitative methodology, may extend much further than the research paradigm. Its value in the recruitment environment has recently been noted, where interviewers seek individuals who ‘best fit’ a predetermined criteria. Nursing and midwifery, where attitudes, values and beliefs are paramount, can be seen as such a milieu.

Recruitment consultants frequently purport previous behaviours and histories as paramount in predicting future performance. For a number of decades Gallup Consultancy[21] has studied the relationships between prior experience, attitudes toward work and learning and future performance. Such enquiry has fuelled arguments’ and revealed limitation of traditional interview processes; with the shortcomings widely asserted amongst recruitment specialists (Sullivan 2004[22]).

From the candidate perspective, there is evidence of the interview situation being seen as anxiety provoking. Candidates report perceptions of inequity in status between them and interviewers. A feeling of lack of control frequently ensues; and can often result in responses being minimised (Alfeck et al. 2013[23]). Although not exclusive, male candidates and those from backgrounds unaccustomed to entering higher education, can perceive themselves as on the periphery of ‘best fit’. Regularly these groups can descend into a self-perpetuating situation. Truncated or kerbed responses to traditional ‘question and answer’ type interviews may arise from a desire to protect ‘the self’ but ultimately diminish their ability to express their true worth.

Harper’s (2002[10]) examination of photo elicitation is seen as significant, particularly in this context. Drawing on physiological links he describes the area of the brain processing visual information as evolutionarily more mature. Visual information, could therefore be argued to be interpreted more intensely than its verbal counterpart and evoke a less censored degree of expression. In essence, it is believed that photo elicitation might enable the interviewee to connect core definitions of themselves to their associations within the photographs, their values, principles and beliefs. In terms of widening participation and drawing from those minorities previously deemed as not achieving best match, the use of photographs as a stimulus can be seen as a highly positive attribute to the interview scenario. Not only can perceptions of both parties be tested and constructively substantiated but subtle differences and similarities between candidates can be solicited and confirmed. It is argued that it is these elements that allow the interviewer to be discerning and truly identify the ‘best match’.

This can be considered as pertinent in terms of reducing attrition. It might be that through the rich description, elicited through the photograph’s use, interviewers may obtain a deeper insight into the contextual influences and social aspects of the candidate that, through more traditional interviewing techniques may ordinarily be overlooked (Baker and Wang 2006[24]).

Aligning these rich responses to the ‘best match’ can also be seen as beneficial to the candidate. It may be through understanding of the social context from which the ‘best match’ comes, course providers can create environments of positive socialisation.

The work of Manson and Davies (2009[20]) substantiates this further. Within their article ‘coming to our senses? A critical approach to sensory methodology’, the authors make a solid case for the use sensory methodologies. They succinctly illustrate the ways that sensory understanding is intrinsically linked to lives experiences and as such allows for the identification of resemblances to others, either physically or potentially through shared values and beliefs. If one considers this to be so, then it appears feasible that the use of photo elicitation in the interview setting might facilitate the candidate’s to recall the lived experiences from within the pictures to identify aspects of the ‘best match’ sought by selectors.

Despite the purported benefits, given its uniqueness in terms of recruiting nursing and midwifery students, the idea of using photo elicitation within the interview setting was met with mixed responses. Whilst it was generally perceived as being ‘something different’ and something that might be ‘fun’ to include, its value in terms of being able to identify best match candidates remained a tenuous concept. With an agreed willingness to ‘test the water’, photo elicitation was introduced. In order to relieve potential anxieties some features of the more traditional interview process were retained. Not least, because these tried and tested elements had made a valuable contribution to selection in the past. In the majority of cases candidates brought with them photographs of close family members, and commonly identified themselves in the context of this family union. Studies undertaken by Stephan Guscheker (2000, in Harper 2002[10]), as part of a Ph.D dissertation, purported the meaningfulness of sharing this information and described it as the ‘realities of their lives’.

Within their work, Wray Barrett and Aspland (2010[25]) determined the significance of interviewers recognising this reality as key in terms of commitment to completion of the course; observing this as closely related to perceived environmental socialisation. Herein, courses identified as family ‘un-friendly’ were seen as negating the need for students to be integrated to the institution in the same way as they are committed to socialisation with their families. Indeed,
students had cited this social integration as an expectation from enrolment on the course (Hughes 2013[7]).

Cuseo (2010[6]) talks of this in terms of congruence versus incongruence and attributes attrition to poor institutional fit. He goes on further to state that this may stem from ‘mis-match between the students’ expectations, interests or values and those of the prevailing university community. It can be argued that the use of photo elicitation at interview is a strategy that is better able to align expectations, values and interests of all parties and as such can bridge the void and reduce attrition.

2.1 Evaluation of the process

In order to ascertain the value of the of photo elicitation it was clear that an evaluation of broad perspectives would be required. The author was conscious that the timing of data collection was significant. For this reason the evaluation requests were not actioned until after candidates had been provided with a decision regarding offers. This was particularly important as although ethical approval was not deemed necessary, it was important to ensure that no candidate felt advantaged or disadvantaged by their responses (Polit & Hungler 2008[27]).

2.2 Sample

All candidates invited to attend a personal interview were asked to take part in an evaluation of the use of photo elicitation. Of the 47 candidates asked, 41 agreed to take part. This was a highly positive response and was made up of candidates both with offers and those declined.

In addition Staff servicing the interviews were also asked to evaluate the process. These were made up of lecturers, Midwifery Clinicians, Service Users, and current students. Again responses were readily forthcoming with a distinct liking for the process and its value in identifying ‘best match’.

2.3 Data collection

Data were initially collected through evaluation sheets, 15 of which were randomly selected and followed up using tape recorded telephone interviews each lasting between 5 and 8 minutes. Although no time limits were conferred each came to a natural conclusion within this time. Data collection were undertaken at a predetermined time arranged by a third party who had no vested interest in the outcome of the work. All respondents were provided with a code number, in order to protect respondent identity. 15 of the candidates were interviewed. Seven had been accepted onto the course. Eight had been rejected.

3 Findings

The findings were wholly positive in terms of evaluation of the use of PEI. All candidates were explicitly aware that there identity was anonymous and as such the author had anticipated some elements of negativity within responses. This was, however, completely unfounded with all respondents identifying the use of photo elicitation as making a positive contribution to the interview strategy. As the following candidates have expressed.

“It was good that the tutors [interviewers] recognised me as having a life, …kind of what my life experiences can bring to midwifery. That was good, them recognising that I have kids and that”. (anonymous comments of an interview candidate C3).

Another informal evaluation described the process as feeling somewhat anxiety provoking but expressed

“I was really scared, but actually when I came out I really felt like I had been given enough time for the interview people to see that I am really keen…” (anonymous comments from interview candidate C15).

“I have had a few interviews and all the others have been a bit ‘same old questions’ that everyone knows how to answer, so you don’t really stand a chance. This was different.” (anonymous comments of an interview candidate C7).

It was perhaps this final example that confirmed the methodology’s value.

“When I got the letter asking me to come to interview I was really pleased. I mean really, really pleased. This was my third time of trying to get on the course and although I had been given feedback in the past, I still found it really hard to get across what I wanted to say. I had always thought that if they asked about my family and friends I would be able to show what a nice person I am and that I really want to be a midwife….” “At first I thought it would be really hard, but they [the interview panel] seemed really interested in what I had to say about my pictures. I only took two and so I thought I wouldn’t fill the time but it was amazing. I came out of the interview knowing I had done my best and that was a lovely feeling. I felt like even if I don’t get on the course I was given the chance to do my best...” “It is funny but it felt like they [the interview panel] were picking someone to be friends with, like the university
is a big family. That felt nice. Although I did not get a place, I am hopeful for next year…”
(anonymous comments of an interview candidate C 13).

Responses linked well with literature asserting that candidates need to feel that the university is committed to them before they can truly give of themselves. Draper’s work (2002[28]), considered the earlier assertions of Tinto (1975[8]), who emphasised the need for university’s to take the lead in fostering an equitable commitment in order to reduce attrition. Figure 1, succinctly demonstrates the ways in which photo elicitation within the interview setting can lay the foundations for this mutual commitment. Through the increase of opportunity for the candidate to demonstrate their strengths; and recognition by the interviewer of the resemblance to essential qualities, those candidates meeting the ‘best match’ can be identified.

![Figure 1: Draper S. (2002[28]) Adapted model of Integration.](image)

Interviewers also found the experience of using photo elicitation positive. Detail disclosed through elicitation appeared to act as an aide memoir, with interviewers able to recall significantly more detail about each candidate as an individual.

“It was a good experience. I can recall each individual from interview because I can relate to what they said, using their photos. It has made my decision making much easier”. (Lecturer interviewer L6)

Service partners with whom the awarding of places was jointly decided also expressed positivity.

“That was a really good experience. It certainly cut the wheat from the chaff. You could tell straight away that what they [the interviewees] were saying was the absolute truth and it came straight from the heart.………, I can see x, y and z [gave candidates’ names] making excellent midwives. They used their photos really well to show us that they have got what it takes and will stay the course”. (Service partner interviewer SP 2)

Service users were also explicit in their thoughts about the use of PE as an interview technique with one describing it really valuable; and additionally felt that their original comments as to the ‘candidate profile’ and the contribution that had provided in determining ‘best match’ had been considered.

“That was a really enjoyable experience. I think the ones chosen are really what I want a midwife to be. I wasn’t sure that they were listening really the staff developing the profile / best match when we did the profile thing. [pause]. They did though. And those girls [the candidates] defo showed me that they have got what it takes…It was their pictures. They say a picture doesn’t lie. The proof was there. Some of them really didn’t have a clue but those who did, know it can be bad as well as good…They have got what it takes.” (Service User interview SU4 &1 together)
This is both interesting and necessary as the interviewer can essentially be seen as the initial gate keeper of the profession. With a responsibility to the general public and to ensure that the reputation of the profession is upheld (Nursing and Midwifery Council 2008[20]), strategies that support confident decision making around recruitment are essential.

4 Final reflections

The author’s reflections on the experience of using photo elicitation within the interview environment have resulted in a strong belief of its value. Given the positive nature of the informal evaluations, it appears as an excellent resource.

Certainly, the value of photo elicitation in creating an environment of mutual understanding cannot be understated. Moreover, its success can be measured in terms of enhancing the concept of commitment by both parties. The use of this methodology has enabled candidates to express their values and beliefs in a personal and meaningful way. This has, in turn, enabled interviewers to identify candidates that meet ‘best match’ pre-requisites; to risk assess their potential for attrition through the resemblance of their values and beliefs in relation to those of governing bodies; and the demonstration of social integration skills that represent dedication to completion of the course.

For the future a more formal evaluation of photo elicitation’s use within interviews will be undertaken. This will be an anonymous activity and will be administered by someone outside of the interview panel. This will ensure confidentiality and preserve anonymity of the candidate. This is seen to be essential as it ensures ethical principles are upheld. As importantly it can serve to reassure participants of the evaluation that decisions will not be made based on their responses and as such encourage them to partake fully.

The use of photo elicitation within the interview setting has been seen as a positive experience by both candidates and staff engaged in the dialogue created. With a history of this sensory methodology eliciting deep and meaningful data, it can be seen as a highly credible alternative to the more traditional type of engagement commonly used in selection processes.

Conflicts of Interest Disclosure

The author declares that there is no conflict of interest statement.

References


